

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Ozone Review Panel
Public Teleconference
March 9, 2012**

Date and Time: Friday, March 9, 2012, 9:00 AM – 1:00 PM ET

Location: Teleconference Only

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to review a draft report entitled “CASAC Review of the EPA’s Integrated Science Assessment for Ozone and Related Photochemical Oxidants (Second External Review Draft – September 2011)”

Participants: Ozone Review Panel (for full roster, see Attachment A)

Dr. Jonathan Samet, CASAC Chair

Mr. George Allen

Dr. John Bailar

Dr. Michelle Bell

Dr. Joseph Brain

Dr. David Chock

Dr. Ana Diez-Roux

Dr. W. Michael Foster

Dr. Judith Graham

Dr. David Grantz

Dr. Jack Harkema

Dr. Daniel Jacob

Dr. Frederick Miller

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell

Dr. Helen Suh

Dr. James Ultman

Dr. Sverre Vedal

Dr. Kathleen Weathers

Dr. Peter Woodbury

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer (DFO)

Other Attendees (See Attachment B)

Friday, March 9, 2012

Opening Remarks

Mr. Aaron Yeow, the DFO for the public teleconference of the CASAC Ozone Review Panel took roll and opened the meeting. He noted that as required under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the Panel's deliberations are held in public with advanced notice given in the Federal Register¹, and the meeting minutes will be made publicly available after the meeting. He noted that the Panel received several public comments and requests from the public to present oral comments. He also noted that the SAB Staff Office determined that there were no issues with conflict-of-interest or appearance of a lack of impartiality for any of the advisory panel members participating in the review. He then turned the meeting over to Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair of the CASAC.

Dr. Samet welcomed everyone, stated the purpose of the teleconference was to review the Panel's draft review of EPA's 2nd Draft Ozone ISA, and reviewed the Agenda². He noted that Chapters 3 and 10 would be grouped together and saved for discussion for when Dr. Jacob joined the teleconference.

Public Comments

There were 5 registered public speakers and they presented according to the order in the List of Public Speakers³.

Janice Nolen, American Lung Association made oral comments and urged the Panel to close out the review with the 2nd draft Ozone ISA, to not delay the Ozone NAAQS with a review of a 3rd draft Ozone ISA.

Deborah Shprentz, Atmospherix, provided her oral comments⁴ and stated that there were no showstoppers in the 2nd draft Ozone ISA that required a CASAC review of a 3rd draft ISA. She also made comments relating to the issue of respiratory symptoms in asthmatic children

Terry McGuire, Sierra Club, presented his oral statement⁵ and urged the Panel not to impede the progress of the Ozone NAAQS with a 3rd review of the ISA.

Julie Goodman, Gradient, gave her oral comments⁶ and stated that the causal determination for cardiovascular effects should not be upgraded to "likely" and that EPA should not consider risks down to a zero ozone level.

Nicole Downey, Earth System Sciences, made an oral statement⁷ and thanked the Panel for listening to and incorporating many of the public comments from the January 2012 meeting into the Panel's review. She suggested that: (1) the Panel recommend that EPA consider formulating the proposed ozone NAAQS in a manner that is consistent with the uncertainties of the models used to estimate background ozone, (2) that EPA should summarize at what point background becomes important for different area, and (3) that as the NAAQS approaches background levels,

both the positive and negative health effects of emissions of criteria pollutants and their precursors should be considered.

Discussion of Letter to Administrator

The Panel proceeded through the Letter to the Administrator and had some discussion on the recommendation for a review of a 3rd draft of the ISA. Although they recognized that this would result in a 2-3 month delay in EPA's Ozone NAAQS schedule, they came to agreement that the changes recommended by the Panel were of a sufficient magnitude to warrant a 3rd review that would target the changes. They thought that ensuring that the science was correct was more important than a few months delay in the schedule.

Discussion of Consensus Responses

The Panel proceeded through the Consensus Responses and there was some discussion on animal-to-human extrapolation modeling in Chapter 5. The Panel came to agreement regarding changes that would be made to clarify the Panel's recommendation. For Chapters 6-7, it was agreed that a bullet would be added regarding acute and chronic animal toxicology studies and their implications for human health. For Chapter 9, the Panel agreed to add a statement encouraging the Agency to develop standard terminology and concepts for populations at risk that can be broadly applicable across NAAQS pollutants. For Chapter 3, it was agreed that a third important study on background ozone would be added as well as a discussion on why the studies were important and needed to be included in the ISA.

The Panel and the members of CASAC were satisfied with the letter/report with the changes discussed and did not have any further comments.

With business concluded, the meeting was adjourned by the DFO at 10:50 am.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as Accurate:

/Signed/

/Signed/

Mr. Aaron Yeow
Designated Federal Officer
EPA SAB Staff Office

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet
Chair
CASAC

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the CASAC website:

<http://www.epa.gov/casac>, at the [March 9, 2012 CASAC Ozone Review Panel Meeting page](#):

¹ Federal Register Notice Announcing the Meeting

² Agenda for March 9, 2012 Public Meeting

³ List of Public Speakers

⁴ Oral Statement from Deborah Shprentz, Atmospherix

⁵ Oral Statement from Terry McGuire, Sierra Club

⁶ Oral Statement from Julie Goodman, Gradient

⁷ Oral Statement from Nicole Downey, Earth System Sciences, LLC

ATTACHMENT A - ROSTER

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee Ozone Review Panel

CASAC CHAIR

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet, Professor and Flora L. Thornton Chair, Department of Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

CASAC MEMBERS

Mr. George A. Allen, Senior Scientist, Northeast States for Coordinated Air Use Management (NESCAUM), Boston, MA

Dr. Ana Diez-Roux, Professor of Epidemiology, School of Public Health, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction and Environmental Engineering, College of Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA

Dr. Helen Suh, Program Area Director, Environmental Health, Public Health Division, National Opinion Research Corporation (NORC) at the University of Chicago, West Newton, MA

Dr. Kathleen Weathers, Senior Scientist, Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies, Millbrook, NY

CONSULTANTS

Mr. Ed Avol*, Professor, Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

Dr. John Bailar, Scholar in Residence, The National Academies, Washington, DC

Dr. Michelle Bell, Professor, School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, Yale University, New Haven, CT

Dr. Joseph D. Brain, Cecil K. and Philip Drinker Professor of Environmental Physiology, Department of Environmental Health, Harvard School of Public Health, Harvard University, Boston, MA

Dr. David Chock, Independent Consultant, Bloomfield Hills, MI

Dr. William Michael Foster, Professor, Pulmonary and Critical Care Medicine, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, NC

Dr. Judith Graham, Independent Consultant, Pittsboro, NC

Dr. David Grantz, Department of Botany and Plant Sciences, University of California at Riverside, Kearney Agricultural Center, Parlier, CA

Dr. Jack Harkema, Professor, Department of Pathobiology, College of Veterinary Medicine, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI

Dr. Daniel Jacob, Professor, Atmospheric Sciences, School of Engineering and Applied Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

Dr. Steven Kleeberger, Professor and Lab Chief, Laboratory of Respiratory Biology, National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, National Institutes of Health, Research Triangle Park, NC

Dr. Frederick J. Miller, Independent Consultant, Cary, NC

Dr. Howard Neufeld, Professor, Department of Biology, Appalachian State University, Boone, NC

Dr. James Ultman, Professor, Chemical Engineering, Bioengineering Program, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA

Dr. Sverre Vedal, Professor, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health Sciences, School of Public Health, University of Washington, Seattle, WA

Dr. Peter Woodbury, Senior Research Associate, Department of Crop and Soil Sciences, College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Science Advisory Board (1400R), 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Washington, DC 20460

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Science Advisory Board (1400R), 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC, 20460

* Did not participate in this review

ATTACHMENT B – Other Attendees
CASAC Ozone Panel Public Teleconference
(Persons who requested the teleconference call-in number or indicated they were on the call)

March 9, 2012

Name	Affiliation
Buckley, Barbara	USEPA
Davis, Matthew	USEPA
Deitrich, Casey	CQ Transcriptions
Devries, Dawn	Encana Oil & Gas (USA), Inc.
DiBiase, Scott	Pinal County Air Quality
Downey, Nicole	Earth System Sciences LLC
Dutton, Steve	USEPA
Erraguntla , Neeraja	Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
Goodman, Julie	Gradient
Langworthy, Lucinda	Hunton & Williams LLP
Long, Tom	USEPA
Luben, Tom	USEPA
McGuire, Terry	Sierra Club
Nolen, Janice	American Lung Association
Oakes, Michelle	USEPA
Ollison, Will	American Petroleum Institute
Owens, Beth	USEPA
Parker, Stuart	InsideEPA
Patel, Molini	USEPA
Reyes, Alexandra	CQ Transcriptions
Ross, Mary	USEPA
Sphrentz, Deborah	Atmospherix
Vandenberg, John	USEPA
Wilson, Linda	New York State Office of the Attorney General
Zufall, Maria	GP Environmental Affairs